

Tompkins County Compensation Analysis CSEA Blue Collar Group

FEBRUARY 1, 2023



BURKE GROUP

Overview

- Background and Objectives
- Common Compensation Objectives
- Survey Sources and Assumptions
- Market Analysis
- Appendix
 - Local Town Data

Background and Objectives

Tompkins County has requested a compensation study of all CSEA Blue Collar positions (approximately 32).

The objectives of the analysis are as follows:

- Conduct an analysis of salaries, including external salary surveys for all positions using multiple market points and compile and analyze data to determine if and how salary scales should be adjusted to maintain market competitiveness.
- Meet with Human Resources Department staff, the County Administrator and the Legislature and/or its appropriate sub-committees as needed and requested throughout the process.

Common Compensation Objectives

External Competitiveness

- To align internal salaries with the competitive marketplace
- Define competitive pay for jobs of comparable value or grade

Internal Equity

- To understand the relative value of jobs to one another
- Ensure consistency in application

The hierarchy of jobs in the organization relative to:

- Responsibilities
- Skills required
- Impact of position
- Reporting relationship

A basis for communicating with employees that has:

- An equitable and market driven compensation system
- A process for salary increases and promotions, managed on a fair and consistent basis

Survey Sources, Peer Group & Assumptions

Survey Sources	Peer Group	Assumptions
<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ New York State Association of Counties (NYSAC)▪ Economic Research Institute (ERI) - Salary Assessor▪ Greater Rochester Chamber of Commerce - Wage & Salary Surveys▪ New York State DOL▪ U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics	<p>Cayuga County City of Ithaca Saratoga County Seneca County</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ County Government▪ 2023 Budget - \$210.7M▪ Geographical Area<ul style="list-style-type: none">- New York State – Finger Lakes Region- Ithaca NY - Metropolitan Area

Tompkins County

CSEA Blue Collar – Effective 1/1/22

Labor Grade	Hire Rate (1st 9 mths)	Work Rate (after 9 mths)	35 Hr Hire Rate	35 Hr Work Rate	37.5 Hr Hire Rate	37.5 Hr Work Rate	40 Hr Hire Rate	40 Hr Work Rate
14	\$29.23	\$31.72	\$53,199	\$57,730	\$56,999	\$61,854	\$60,798	\$65,978
13	\$27.19	\$29.52	\$49,486	\$53,726	\$53,021	\$57,564	\$56,555	\$61,402
12	\$25.83	\$28.03	\$47,011	\$51,015	\$50,369	\$54,659	\$53,726	\$58,302
11	\$24.53	\$26.66	\$44,645	\$48,521	\$47,834	\$51,987	\$51,022	\$55,453
9	\$22.17	\$24.07	\$40,349	\$43,807	\$43,232	\$46,937	\$46,114	\$50,066
8	\$21.05	\$22.86	\$38,311	\$41,605	\$41,048	\$44,577	\$43,784	\$47,549
7	\$20.01	\$21.73	\$36,418	\$39,549	\$39,020	\$42,374	\$41,621	\$45,198
5	\$19.05	\$19.61	\$34,671	\$35,690	\$37,148	\$38,240	\$39,624	\$40,789
2	\$15.37	NA	\$27,973	NA	\$29,972	NA	\$31,970	NA

Tompkins County

Market Analysis

Tompkins Position	TC Labor Grade	Hire Rate (1st 9 mths)	Work Rate (after 9 mths)
Senior Highway Crew Supervisor	14	\$29.23	\$31.72
Senior HVAC Systems Technician	14	\$29.23	\$31.72
Waste Reduction & Recycling Coord	14	\$29.23	\$31.72
		\$29.23	\$31.72

Peer / Market Position	Peer Average Starting Rate	Market Average Rate
Highway/Construction Supervisor - Senior	\$31.10	\$33.94
Senior Building Maint Mechanic/HVAC Mech III	\$25.30	\$33.05
Recycling Coordinator/Program Manager	NA	\$33.62
	\$28.20	\$33.54

TC Hire Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Work Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Hire Rate to Market Average Rate	TC Work Rate to Market Average Rate
94.0%	102.0%	86.1%	93.5%
115.5%	125.4%	88.4%	96.0%
NA	NA	86.9%	94.3%
104.8%	113.7%	87.2%	94.6%

Airport Operations Supervisor	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
Cleaning Operations Supervisor	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
Electrician	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
General Maintenance Supervisor	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
Highway Technician	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
HVAC Systems Technician	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
Senior Heavy Equipment Mechanic	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
Solid Waste Enforcement Office	13	\$27.19	\$29.52
		\$27.19	\$29.52

NA	NA	NA
Custodial Supervisor	NA	\$29.06
Electrician/Electrician Journeyman	\$26.48	\$31.11
General Maintenance Supervisor	\$26.19	\$29.11
Construction Scheduler/Specialist	\$28.43	\$31.00
HVAC Mechanic II	NA	\$29.01
Garage (Mech/Parts) Supv-Sr Heavy Equip Mech	\$28.23	\$29.97
NA	NA	NA
	\$27.33	\$29.88

NA	NA	NA	NA
NA	NA	93.6%	101.6%
102.7%	111.5%	87.4%	94.9%
103.8%	112.7%	93.4%	101.4%
95.6%	103.8%	87.7%	95.2%
NA	NA	93.7%	101.8%
96.3%	104.6%	90.7%	98.5%
NA	NA	NA	NA
99.6%	108.1%	91.1%	98.9%

Tompkins County

Market Analysis

Tompkins Position	TC Labor Grade	Hire Rate (1st 9 mths)	Work Rate (after 9 mths)
Highway Crew Supervisor	12	\$25.83	\$28.03
Waste Reduction & Recycling Specialist	12	\$25.83	\$28.03
		\$25.83	\$28.03

Peer / Market Position	Peer Average Starting Rate	Market Average Rate
Construction Supervisor	\$23.40	\$29.83
Environmental Specialist	NA	\$30.13
	\$23.40	\$29.98

TC Hire Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Work Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Hire Rate to Market Average Rate	TC Work Rate to Market Average Rate
110.4%	119.8%	86.6%	94.0%
NA	NA	85.7%	93.0%
110.4%	119.8%	86.2%	93.5%

Carpenter	11	\$24.53	\$26.66
Equipment Service/Parts Room Tech	11	\$24.53	\$26.66
Heavy Equipment Mechanic	11	\$24.53	\$26.66
Recycling Operations Specialist	11	\$24.53	\$26.66
Welder	11	\$24.53	\$26.66
		\$24.53	\$26.66

Maintenance Carpenter	NA	\$28.68
Parts Manager I/Heavy Equipment Mechanic	\$23.64	\$26.16
Auto/Diesel Mechanic/Heavy Equipment Mech	\$23.83	\$26.23
NA	NA	NA
Bridge Maintainer/Welder	\$23.94	\$25.49
	\$23.80	\$26.64

NA	NA	85.5%	93.0%
103.8%	112.8%	93.8%	101.9%
102.9%	111.9%	93.5%	101.6%
NA	NA	NA	NA
102.5%	111.4%	96.2%	104.6%
103.1%	112.0%	92.3%	100.3%

Equipment Service Technician	9	\$22.17	\$24.07
Heavy Equipment Operator	9	\$22.17	\$24.07
		\$22.17	\$24.07

Motor Equip Mech Helper/Auto/Equip Svc Tech	\$22.05	\$23.85
Heavy Equipment Operator	\$22.21	\$24.84
	\$22.13	\$24.35

100.5%	109.2%	93.0%	100.9%
99.8%	108.4%	89.3%	96.9%
100.2%	108.8%	91.1%	98.9%

Tompkins County

Market Analysis

Tompkins Position	TC Labor Grade	Hire Rate (1st 9 mths)	Work Rate (after 9 mths)	Peer / Market Position	Peer Average Starting Rate	Market Average Rate	TC Hire Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Work Rate to Peer Starting Rate	TC Hire Rate to Market Average Rate	TC Work Rate to Market Average Rate
Facilities Shopkeeper	8	\$21.05	\$22.86	Stock Room Clerk/Procurement/Inv Specialist	\$19.49	\$23.73	108.0%	117.3%	88.7%	96.3%
HVAC Systems Mechanic	8	\$21.05	\$22.86	Building Maintenance Mechanic/HVAC Mech I	\$21.46	\$25.94	98.1%	106.5%	81.1%	88.1%
Maintenance Mechanic	8	\$21.05	\$22.86	Building Maintenance Mechanic	\$21.46	\$24.59	98.1%	106.5%	85.6%	93.0%
Motor Equipment Operator	8	\$21.05	\$22.86	Motor Equipment Operator	\$21.17	\$23.31	99.4%	108.0%	90.3%	98.1%
Senior Cleaner	8	\$21.05	\$22.86	Senior Cleaner/Custodian	\$22.46	\$22.97	93.7%	101.8%	91.6%	99.5%
		\$21.05	\$22.86		\$21.21	\$24.11	99.5%	108.0%	87.5%	95.0%
Maintenance Worker	7	\$20.01	\$21.73	Maintenance Worker	\$20.95	\$22.90	95.5%	103.7%	87.4%	94.9%
Recycling Driver	7	\$20.01	\$21.73	Maintenance Worker	\$20.95	\$22.90	95.5%	103.7%	87.4%	94.9%
		\$20.01	\$21.73		\$20.95	\$22.90	95.5%	103.7%	87.4%	94.9%
Cleaner	5	\$19.05	\$19.61	Custodial Worker/Cleaner-Commercial	\$18.34	\$20.96	103.9%	106.9%	90.9%	93.6%
		\$19.05	\$19.61		\$18.34	\$20.96	103.9%	106.9%	90.9%	93.6%
Seasonal Worker	2	\$15.37	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
		\$15.37	NA		NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

Market Analysis - Summary

CSEA Blue Collar Group

Labor Grade	Hire Rate (1st 9 mths)	Work Rate (after 9 mths)	Peer Average Starting Rate by Grade	Market Average Rate by Grade	TC Hire Rate to Peer Average Starting Rate by Grade	TC Work Rate to Peer Average Starting Rate by Grade	TC Hire Rate to Market Average Rate by Grade	TC Work Rate to Market Average Rate by Grade
14	\$29.23	\$31.72	\$28.20	\$33.54	104.8%	113.7%	87.2%	94.6%
13	\$27.19	\$29.52	\$27.33	\$29.88	99.6%	108.1%	91.1%	98.9%
12	\$25.83	\$28.03	\$23.40	\$29.98	110.4%	119.8%	86.2%	93.5%
11	\$24.53	\$26.66	\$23.80	\$26.64	103.1%	112.0%	92.3%	100.3%
9	\$22.17	\$24.07	\$22.13	\$24.35	100.2%	108.8%	91.1%	98.9%
8	\$21.05	\$22.86	\$21.21	\$24.11	99.5%	108.0%	97.5%	95.0%
7	\$20.01	\$21.73	\$20.95	\$22.90	95.5%	103.7%	87.4%	94.9%
5	\$19.05	\$19.61	\$18.34	\$20.96	103.9%	106.9%	90.9%	93.6%
2	\$15.37	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
					102.1%	110.1%	90.5%	96.2%

Note: Averages taken from previous pages

Appendix I

Local Town Data

Position	Ulysses 2023	Dryden 2023						Ithaca 2023					Lansing 2023							
	Hire	Hire	6 months to 1 yr	1 - 5 Years	5 - 10 Years	10 - 15 Years	15+ Years	Hiring Minimum	Hiring Rate	Step 1 (1st Aniv Yr)	Step 2 (2nd Aniv Yr)	Step 3 (3rd Aniv Yr)	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8
Laborer		\$24.55	\$25.05	\$26.05	\$27.05	\$28.05	\$29.05	\$21.38	\$22.50	\$23.00	\$23.50	\$23.75	\$21.04	\$21.90	\$22.77	\$23.61	\$24.48	\$25.35	\$26.21	\$27.34
Laborer W/CDL - A or B									\$24.56	\$25.06	\$25.56	\$25.81								
MEO													\$25.31	\$26.27	\$27.23	\$28.21	\$29.16	\$36.12		
Automotive Mechanic/MEO													\$28.05	\$29.16	\$30.17	\$31.22	\$32.30	\$39.20		
MEO / MEO 1 (Class B License)	\$25.50	\$26.55	\$27.05	\$28.05	\$29.05	\$30.05	\$31.05	\$25.70	\$27.31	\$27.81	\$28.31	\$28.56								
Automotive Mechanic Asst W/Class B								\$25.70	\$27.31	\$27.81	\$28.31	\$28.56								
MEO 2 (Class A License)		\$27.10	\$27.60	\$28.60	\$29.60	\$30.60	\$31.60		\$28.97	\$29.47	\$29.97	\$30.22								
Automotive Mechanic Asst W/Class A									\$28.97	\$29.47	\$29.97	\$30.22								
MEO / Water/Sewer/Maint Worker	\$25.75																			
Equipment Service Technician		\$27.35	\$27.85	\$28.85	\$29.85	\$30.85	\$31.85													
Deputy Highway Superintendent	\$26.00																			
Heavy Equipment Mechanic		\$29.40	\$29.90	\$30.90	\$31.90	\$32.90	\$33.90	\$28.23	\$30.12	\$30.62	\$31.12	\$31.37								
Engineering Technician I								\$28.23	\$30.12	\$30.62	\$31.12	\$31.37								
Heavy Equipment Operator (HEO)								\$28.23	\$30.12	\$30.62	\$31.12	\$31.37								
Maintenance Worker								\$28.23	\$30.12	\$30.62	\$31.12	\$31.37								
Heavy Equipment Mechanic								\$28.23	\$30.12	\$30.62	\$31.12	\$31.37								
Working Supervisor								\$30.43	\$32.56	\$33.06	\$33.56	\$33.81								
Sr Heavy Equipment Mechanic								\$30.43	\$32.56	\$33.06	\$33.56	\$33.81								
Sr Engineering Technician								\$30.43	\$32.56	\$33.06	\$33.56	\$33.81								
Maintenance Supervisor								\$30.43	\$32.56	\$33.06	\$33.56	\$33.81								
Maint Worker / Laborer (DPW)		\$23.20	\$23.70	\$24.70	\$25.70	\$26.70	\$27.70													
Maint Worker / MEO With CDL (DPW)		\$26.55	\$27.05	\$28.05	\$29.05	\$30.05	\$31.05													
Maint Worker Asst to Super (DPW)		\$26.80	\$27.30	\$28.30	\$29.30	\$30.30	\$31.30													
Working Supervisor (DPW)		\$27.05	\$27.55	\$28.55	\$29.55	\$30.55	\$31.55													

Appendix II

Local Town Data (Town of Ithaca)

FIELD SYSTEM JOB CLASSIFICATION LISTING		2023 Wage Scale							
Effective:	1/1/2017 TB Res#: 2016-112	INCREASE		Class I-V- Teamsters			Promotions start	Per Contract	
2080	Hours based on full time of	104.00%							
Class	Civil Service Title	HIRING MINIMUM	Hiring Rate	Step 1 1st Anniv. Yr.	Step 2- 2nd Anniv. Yr.	Step 3 - 3rd Anniv. Yr.	JOB RATE 1/1		
HOURLY POSITIONS		HOURLY							
V	Working Supervisor	Hourly:		1.54%	1.51%	0.74%	33.810		
	Sr. Heavy Equipment Mechanic	40 hrs/wk	\$ 30.43 \$ 32.56	\$ 33.06	\$ 33.56	\$ 33.81	\$ 33.81	4.00%	
	Sr. Engineering Technician	per hour increase:	\$ 63,292.32 \$ 67,724.80	\$ 68,764.80	\$ 69,804.80	\$ 70,324.80	\$ 70,324.80	\$ 2,704.00	
	Maintenance Supervisor							7.78%	
IV	Engineering Technician I	Hourly:		1.66%	1.63%	0.80%	31.368		
	Heavy Equipment Operator (HEO)	40 hrs/wk	\$ 28.23 \$ 30.12	\$ 30.62	\$ 31.12	\$ 31.37	\$ 31.37	4.01%	
	Maintenance Worker	per hour increase:	\$ 58,724.64 \$ 62,649.60	\$ 63,689.60	\$ 64,729.60	\$ 65,249.60	\$ 65,249.60	\$ 2,516.80	
	Heavy Equipment Mechanic							3.81%	
III	MEO w/ class A	Hourly:	HEO-\$1.15	1.73%	1.70%	0.83%	29.558		
	Automotive Mechanic Assistant w/ class A	40 hrs/wk	\$ 28.97 \$ 27.31	\$ 29.47	\$ 29.97	\$ 30.22	\$ 30.22	4.17%	
	per hour increase:	\$ 60,257.60 \$ 56,804.80	\$ 61,297.60	\$ 62,337.60	\$ 62,857.60	\$ 62,857.60	\$ 2,516.80	5.81%	
	Motor Equipment Operator (MEO) w/ class B	Hourly:		1.83%	1.80%	0.88%	28.558		
	Automotive Mechanic Assistant w/class B	40 hrs/wk	\$ 25.70 \$ 27.31	\$ 27.81	\$ 28.31	\$ 28.56	\$ 28.56	4.01%	
	per hour increase:	\$ 53,464.32 \$ 56,804.80	\$ 57,844.80	\$ 58,884.80	\$ 59,404.80	\$ 59,404.80	\$ 2,288.00	10.65%	
II	Laborer w/ CDL -class A or B	Hourly:	MEO-\$2.75	2.04%	2.00%	0.98%	25.743		
		40 hrs/wk	\$ 24.56 \$ 25.06	\$ 25.06	\$ 25.56	\$ 25.81	\$ 25.81	4.45%	
	per hour increase:	\$ 51,084.80 \$ 52,124.80	\$ 52,124.80	\$ 53,164.80	\$ 53,684.80	\$ 53,684.80	\$ 2,288.00	8.70%	
I	Laborer	Hourly:		2.22%	2.17%	1.06%	23.743		
		40 hrs/wk	\$ 21.38 \$ 22.50	\$ 23.00	\$ 23.50	\$ 23.75	\$ 23.75	4.03%	
	per hour increase:	\$ 44,460.00 \$ 46,800.00	\$ 47,840.00	\$ 48,880.00	\$ 49,400.00	\$ 49,400.00	\$ 1,913.60		

NOTES: *New employees hired at Hiring Rate and progress to Job Rate.
 *New hires receive wage increases on January 1st.
 *New hires shall reach Job Rate on January 1st of their 3rd Anniversary year.
 *Once new hires reach Job Rate, wage increases will occur on 1/1, same as other employees.
 *Job Rate will be adjusted annually based on a living adjustment percentage or increments if and as determined by the TB when finalizing the budget.
 *Hiring Minimum will be adjusted as determined by the TB
 *for internal promotions employee will start at Step 1 of that classification.

Appendix II

Local Town Data (Town of Dryden)

Town of Dryden
Highway/DPW Wage Pay Scale
Proposed 1/1/2023

	Increment 0-6 months	\$ 0.50 6 m to 1 yr	\$ 1.00 1 - 5 yrs	\$ 1.00 5 - 10 yrs	\$ 1.00 10 - 15 yrs	\$ 1.00 15 + years
Highway						
Laborer	24.55	25.05	26.05	27.05	28.05	29.05
MEO 1 (Class B License)	26.55	27.05	28.05	29.05	30.05	31.05
MEO 2 (Class A License)	27.10	27.60	28.60	29.60	30.60	31.60
MEO 1 at former HEO 1 Class B (2 current employees)	27.15	27.65	28.65	29.65	30.65	31.65
MEO 2 at former HEO 2 Class A (4 current employees)	27.40	27.90	28.90	29.90	30.90	31.90
Equipment Service Technician	27.35	27.85	28.85	29.85	30.85	31.85
Heavy Equipment Mechanic	29.40	29.90	30.90	31.90	32.90	33.90
DPW						
Maintenance Worker/Laborer	23.20	23.70	24.70	25.70	26.70	27.70
Maintenance Worker/MEO with CDL	26.55	27.05	28.05	29.05	30.05	31.05
Maintenance Worker Asst to Supt	26.80	27.30	28.30	29.30	30.30	31.30
Working Supervisor	27.05	27.55	28.55	29.55	30.55	31.55
Longevity Payments - Paid in January						
Employees with 20 plus years of Service	1%					
Employees with 25 plus years of Service	2%					
Employees with 30 plus years of Service	3%					
Employees with 35 plus years of Service	4%					
				Night Shift +\$1.50/hour		
				Wages to increase on January 1		
				2024 \$	2.00	
				2025 \$	2.00	
				2026 \$	2.00	

Appendix II

Local Town Data (Town of Ulysses)

Town of Ulysses

	<u>2022</u>	<u>2023</u>	<u>2024</u>
MEO	24.50	25.50	26.25
MEO/Water/Sewer/Maintenance Worker	25.75	25.75	26.50
Deputy Highway Superintendent	25.00	26.00	26.75

Probational wages are \$1.00 less than the above schedule.

Appendix II

Local Town Data (Town of Lansing – 2023 Structure)

		HIGHWAY DEPARTMENT WAGE & SALARY STRUCTURE										
		RATE	MINIMUM				MIDPOINT		MAXIMUM			
		INCREASE	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6	Step 7	Step 8		
GRADE A	Laborer	4.00%	\$ 21.04	\$ 21.90	\$ 22.77	\$ 23.61	\$ 24.48	\$ 25.35	\$ 26.21	\$ 27.34		
			MINIMUM	MIDPOINT		MAXIMUM						
			Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6				
GRADE C	Motor Equipment Operator	4.00%	\$ 25.31	\$ 26.27	\$ 27.23	\$ 28.21	\$ 29.16	\$ 36.12				
			MINIMUM	MIDPOINT		MAXIMUM						
			Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4	Step 5	Step 6				
GRADE D	Automotive Mechanic/MEO	4.00%	\$ 28.05	\$ 29.16	\$ 30.17	\$ 31.22	\$ 32.30	\$ 39.20				